



# Butte Countywide Homeless Continuum of Care

Monday, September 30, 2024, 1:00 p.m. – 2:00 p.m.

Special Council Member Meeting

Butte County Employment & Social Services

Zoom Link: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/83540783086?pwd=SmJ9FUHKPSyGWA2OVEsMA4o7lIG4Ci.1>

Join by Phone: +1 669 444 9171

Zoom Meeting ID: 835 4078 3086 Passcode: 752182

## COC COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Amber Abney-Bass	Briana Harvey-Butterfield	Jennifer Macarthy	Steve Culleton
Anastacia Snyder	Ian Clement	Matthew McCoy	Tami Ritter
Angie Little	Josh Indar	Meagan Meloy	Tracy Johnstone
Ann Winters	Josh Jamison	Sarah Frohock	
Brad Brunner	Keesha Hills		

CoC Coordinator: Erin Murray  
Recording: Lisa Angle

## AGENDA

- 1) Convene Meeting and Establish Quorum *A. Abney-Bass*
  - A) Virtual Meeting Format. Recording Meeting.
  
- 2) Approval of Priority Listing for HUD Continuum of Care 2024-25 Application – ***ACTION*** *S. Morgado*
  - A) FY 2024 CoC Project Ranking Spreadsheet
  - B) Project Application Scoring Criteria
  
- 3) Next Meeting – Monday, October 21, 2024: Council Member Meeting  
Butte County Department of Employment & Social Services to host Virtual Meeting
  
- 4) ***ADJOURN***

## BUTTE COUNTYWIDE HOMELESS CONTINUUM OF CARE COUNCIL STAFF REPORT

**Date:** September 30, 2024

**To:** CoC Council

**From:** Sherry Morgado, Housing Tools, Consultant for the Butte Countywide Homeless CoC

**RE:** Approval of Priority Listing for HUD Continuum of Care 2024 Application

---

**Requested Action:** Approve a Priority Listing of project applications that will apply under the Butte Countywide Homeless Continuum of Care (CoC) in response to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) federal Fiscal Years 2024 and 2025 Continuum of Care NOFO (NOFO). The Priority Listing is the result of a review and ranking of project applications to be submitted to HUD as part of the Butte CoC NOFO application (Consolidated Application).

**Background:** The HUD Continuum of Care NOFO for fiscal years 2024 and 2025 was released on July 31, 2024. This is the first time HUD has released a two-year NOFO for this funding source. CoC Consolidated Application submittals, which consist of the CoC Application, Project Applications and Priority Listing, are due to HUD by October 30, 2024. It is HUD's intention that the submittals received from CoCs this year will be automatically extended and renewed for 2025.

Section V.B of the 2024 and 2025 NOFO (CoC Application Scoring) states that "HUD will award up to 28 points to CoCs that demonstrate the existence of a single coordinated, inclusive, and outcome-oriented community process for the solicitation, objective review, ranking, and selection of project applications that includes reviewing and a process by which renewal projects are reviewed for performance and compliance with 24 CFR part 578." Points are awarded based upon how well the CoC demonstrates the following in its project application process: use of Objective Criteria, Use of System Performance Measures, a comparable database for DV providers, consideration of rapid returns to housing coupled with severity of barriers, promotion of racial equity, reallocating lower performing renewal projects to create new higher performing projects, and a public, open selection process with timelines that meet HUD requirements. Each CoC must receive project applications at least 30 days prior to the application due date and inform CoC Program project applicants of their ranking position at least 15 days prior to the application due date.

On August 19, 2024, the CoC Council approved a process for the 2024 and 2025 NOFO to solicit renewal, renewal with expansion, and new project applications, with the understanding that expansion or new projects can only be funded if the CoC is awarded the CoC Bonus. At that meeting, the CoC Council approved the 2024 RFP documents for all 3 project types, which included the questions, data and documentation to be addressed by project applicants, along with the scoring criteria for each project type.

**Project Applications Received:**

Renewal Project Applications: A total of 7 renewal project applications were received as follows:  
HMIS—Butte County DESS  
Coordinated Entry (CES)—Butte County DESS

Catalyst RRH—Catalyst DV Services  
Catalyst RRH/TH—Catalyst DV Services  
Avenida Apartments—Caminar  
Base Camp Village—Caminar  
Housing for All—Chico Housing Action Team (CHAT)

Expansion Project Applications: 1 Expansion Project application was received as follows:  
HMIS Expansion—Butte County DESS

New Project Applications: No new project applications were received.

**Review and Ranking Process by CoC Consultant:** The CoC contracted with Housing Tools to conduct an objective review of all 8 project applications and recommend a rank order Priority Listing of those applications to the CoC Council for approval. Housing Tools conducted this review in accordance with the Project Application Scoring Criteria for each project type (Attachment B). The ranked project applications were grouped in Tier 1 and Tier 2 categories, as required by the NOFO. Important items to note when reviewing the Ranking Spreadsheet:

Annual Renewal Demand (ARD): The total amount of all of the CoC's projects eligible for renewal, before any required adjustments to funding for leasing rental assistance and operating budget line items based on Fair Market Rents (FMRs). The 2024 ARD for the Butte CoC is \$629,650.

Tier 1 and Tier 2: HUD requires that CoC's rank all projects received into one of two tiers and HUD annually sets the funding parameters for these tiers:

Tier 1: For the 2024 and 2025 NOFO, HUD has set Tier 1 funding to be equal to 90% of the ARD or \$566,685. The difference between ARD and Tier 1 for this NOFO is \$62,965, which is 10% of ARD. This means that Tier 1 projects are those whose scores and then requested funding ranked them to fall within the 90% of ARD.

Tier 2: For the 2024 and 2025 NOFO, HUD has set Tier 2 funding to be the difference between Tier 1 and the maximum amount of renewal and CoC Bonus funds that the CoC applies for, which is \$173,529. This means that Tier 2 projects are those whose scores and then requested funding push them into the potential funding HUD may make available through the remaining 10% of ARD and the CoC Bonus.

Straddling of Tiers: If a project straddles Tier 1 and Tier 2, HUD will conditionally select the project up to the amount of funding that falls within Tier 1. HUD may fund the Tier 2 portion based upon the CoC score and other rating factors for the CoC Application. If HUD does not fund the Tier 2 portion, it will fund the portion in Tier 1, provided the project is still feasible with the reduced funding.

CoC Bonus: The Priority Listing assumes that the CoC Bonus is received, which would allow for some projects or portions of projects to be funded in Tier 2. ***Please be aware that if the CoC Bonus is not received, the only projects that would receive full funding are those fully within Tier 1, which this year HUD has set at 90% of the Annual Renewal Demand (ARD).*** This means there is an automatic

loss of \$62,965 (10% of the ARD) for the CoC overall within Tier 1. If HUD funds up to the full amount of the ARD, then there will be some opportunity for partial funding of projects in Tier 2. Without the CoC Bonus, there is no opportunity for full funding of projects ranked in Tier 2.

The FY 2024 Butte Countywide Homeless CoC Recommended Priority Listing (Attachment A) shows Housing Tools' recommended ranking of projects based upon our review and scoring of the applications using the CoC approved and adopted RFP scoring criteria (Attachment B), which the CoC approved at its August 19, 2024 meeting.

**Review and Ranking Process by CoC Council:** The Council will conduct the review and ranking process according to the following steps: 1) the full Council may ask Housing Tools questions about their application review and recommended ranking; 2) the full Council and Housing Tools will consider and respond to comments and questions from project applicants and the general public; 3) Council members who represent agencies that have submitted a project application, or who otherwise have a conflict of interest in the review and ranking process, will recuse themselves from further discussion and deliberation; 4) Council members without a conflict of interest will select a Review and Ranking Chair that will break a tie vote by the Council if there are an even number of voting Council members; and 5) Council members without a conflict of interest will further discuss the project ranking, consider any recommended alterations to the rank order, and approve a final Priority Listing to be submitted to HUD as part of the CoCs 2024 and 2025 NOFO application.

#### Attachments

Attachment A: FY 2024 Butte Countywide Homeless CoC Recommended Priority Listing

Attachment B: Project Application Scoring Criteria (Renewal and Expansion)

Attachment A:  
FY 2024-25 CoC Project Ranking  
Spreadsheet

FY2024 Butte Countywide Homeless CoC Recommended Priority Listing

Attachment A

Funding Allocation									Amount	Balance	
	Annual Renewal Demand								\$629,650		
	Potential CoC Bonus								\$110,564		
	Potential DV Bonus	Note: DV Bonus not being applied for							\$0		
	Potential Total Funds Available								\$740,214		
Proposed Ranking	Project Name	Applicant	Service Area	Target Population Served	Primary Use of CoC Funding	Units or Beds	Years in Operation	Grant Term (Years)	Amount Requested	Balance Available	
									<b>Tier 1</b>	<b>\$566,685</b>	
1	HMIS (Renewal)	Butte County DESS	Countywide	N/A	HMIS	N/A	3	1	\$144,080	\$422,605	
2	CES (Renewal)	Butte County DESS	Countywide	N/A	Coordinated Entry	N/A	3	1	\$36,241	\$386,364	
3	HMIS Expansion	Butte County DESS	Countywide	N/A	HMIS	N/A	0	1	\$110,564	\$275,800	
4	Catalyst RRR/TH (Renewal)	Catalyst DV Services	Countywide	Victims of Domestic Violence	Rental Assistance, Supportive Services, Operational Costs	7 beds	2	1	\$112,691	\$163,109	
5	Base Camp Village (Renewal)	Caminar	Countywide	Chronically homeless, mentally ill	Operational Costs	12 beds	5	1	\$87,859	\$75,250	
6	Avenida Apartments (Renewal)	Caminar	Countywide	Chronically homeless, seriously mentally ill	Operational Costs	14 beds	17	1	\$75,250	\$0	
	<b>Tier 1 Total</b>	<b>90% of Annual Renewal Demand = \$566,685</b>							<b>\$566,685</b>		
									<b>Tier 2</b>	<b>\$173,529</b>	
6	Avenida Apartments (Renewal)	Caminar	Countywide	Chronically homeless, seriously mentally ill	Operational Costs	14 beds	17	1	\$16,928	\$156,601	
7	Catalyst RRR (Renewal)	Catalyst DV Services	Countywide	Victims of Domestic Violence	Rental Assistance	10 beds	9	1	\$99,101	\$57,500	
8	Housing for All (Renewal)	Chico Housing Action Team	Chico	Chronically homeless, youth, disabled	Operational Costs	23 beds	0	1	\$57,500	\$0	
	<b>Tier 2 Total</b>	<b>Maximum amount of renewal and CoC Bonus funds the CoC applies for (\$629,650+\$110,564=\$740,214) minus Tier 1 (\$566,685)=\$173,529</b>							<b>\$173,529</b>		
	<b>Maximum Potential Funding</b>	<b>Tier 1 (\$566,685) plus Tier 2 (\$173,529)=\$740,214</b>								<b>\$740,214</b>	<b>\$0</b>

TIER 1:  
\$566,685

TIER 2:  
\$173,529

Attachment B:  
Project Application Scoring Criteria  
(Renewal and Expansion)

**FY 2024 Butte Countywide Homeless Continuum of Care  
Renewal Project Scoring Tool**

Project Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Applicant: \_\_\_\_\_

**Scoring/Ranking Criteria**

Data Source	Total Points Available	Total Points Awarded
Renewal Application in eSnaps; Sections: Recipient Performance, Project Description, Supportive Services, Sources of Match; or New Application in eSnaps for Expansion Projects	25	
Annual Performance Report Data (see detail below)	60	
Responses to Questionnaire (see detail below)	5	
<b>Total</b>	<b>90</b>	

**Annual Performance Report Data**

Prioritization of Housing Those Most in Need (project data from APR)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Percent of project participants with income less than \$1000 at entry into program (Benchmark: 65%; 30% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q16</i>	5	
Percent of project participants with more than one disability type (Benchmark: 50%; 0% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q13a1 and a2</i>	6	
Percent of project participants entering project from place not meant for human habitation (Benchmark: 50%; 0% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q15</i>	10	
Percent of project participants who were chronically homeless at entry into program (Benchmark: 80%; 0% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q5a and Q26b</i>	10	
Domestic Violence Agency Applicants: Percent of project participants who were fleeing violence (Benchmark: 100% of domestic violence program participants; 0% other participants) <i>APR: Q14b</i>	10	



<b>Performance Measures</b> (project data from APR)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Percent of participants that move to Permanent Housing, or remain in Permanent Housing for PSH applicants (Benchmark: 80%) <i>APR: Q22a1 and Q23c</i>	10	
Bed/unit utilization rate (Benchmark: 66%) <i>APR: Q2</i>	2	
Percent of participants whose income increased from the start of their participation to their last assessment. (Benchmark: 50%) <i>APR: Q19a1</i>	1	
Percent of participants with health insurance. (Benchmark: 75%) <i>APR: Q21</i>	1	

<b>Data Quality</b> (Project data from APR or HMIS, or comparable system)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Percent of data quality as reported through HMIS or comparable system (Benchmark: 95%; 0% victim services) <i>APR: Q6a, b, c, d, e, f</i>	2	
HMIS or comparable system Bed Coverage Rate (Benchmark 100%; 0% victim services)  <i>As verified by HMIS</i>	2	
1. Applicant completed most recent APR by designated deadline, yes or no.	1	

### Responses to Questionnaire

<b>Racial Equity and LGBTQ+ Assistance</b> (from Questionnaire)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Project has implemented policies, staff training and/or modified procedures to address barriers and ensure equity/non-discrimination	4	

<b>Innovative Practices to Improve Project Performance</b> (from Questionnaire)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Project implemented innovative practices which have positively impacted project performance and contributed to improvement as measured	1	

through HUD System Performance Measures.		
---	--	--

**FY 2024 Butte Countywide Homeless Continuum of Care  
Expansion Project Scoring Tool**

Project Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Applicant: \_\_\_\_\_

**Scoring/Ranking Criteria**

Data Source	Total Points Available	Total Points Awarded
Renewal Application in eSnaps; Sections: Recipient Performance, Project Description, Supportive Services, Sources of Match; or New Application in eSnaps for Expansion Projects	25	
Annual Performance Report Data (see detail below)	60	
Responses to Questionnaire (see detail below)	5	
<b>Total</b>	<b>90</b>	

**Annual Performance Report Data**

<b>Prioritization of Housing Those Most in Need (project data from APR)</b>	Points Available	Points Awarded
Percent of project participants with income less than \$1000 at entry into program (Benchmark: 65%; 30% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q16</i>	5	
Percent of project participants with more than one disability type (Benchmark: 50%; 0% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q13a1 and a2</i>	6	
Percent of project participants entering project from place not meant for human habitation (Benchmark: 50%; 0% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q15</i>	10	
Percent of project participants who were chronically homeless at entry into program (Benchmark: 80%; 0% victim service participants) <i>APR: Q5a and Q26b</i>	10	
Domestic Violence Agency Applicants: Percent of project participants who were fleeing violence (Benchmark: 100% of domestic violence program participants; 0% other participants) <i>APR: Q14b</i>	10	

<b>Performance Measures</b> (project data from APR)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Percent of participants that move to Permanent Housing, or remain in Permanent Housing for PSH applicants (Benchmark: 80%) <i>APR: Q22a1 and Q23c</i>	10	
Bed/unit utilization rate (Benchmark: 66%) <i>APR: Q2</i>	2	
Percent of participants whose income increased from the start of their participation to their last assessment. (Benchmark: 50%) <i>APR: Q19a1</i>	1	
Percent of participants with health insurance. (Benchmark: 75%) <i>APR: Q21</i>	1	

<b>Data Quality</b> (Project data from APR or HMIS, or comparable system)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Percent of data quality as reported through HMIS or comparable system (Benchmark: 95%; 0% victim services) <i>APR: Q6a, b, c, d, e, f</i>	2	
HMIS or comparable system Bed Coverage Rate (Benchmark 100%; 0% victim services)  <i>As verified by HMIS</i>	2	
1. Applicant completed most recent APR by designated deadline, yes or no.	1	

### Responses to Questionnaire

<b>Racial Equity and LGBTQ+ Assistance</b> (from Questionnaire)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Project has implemented policies, staff training and/or modified procedures to address barriers and ensure equity/non-discrimination	4	

<b>Innovative Practices to Improve Project Performance</b> (from Questionnaire)	Points Available	Points Awarded
Project implemented innovative practices which have positively impacted project performance and contributed to improvement as measured	1	

through HUD System Performance Measures.		
---	--	--